

Pima County Board of Health Minutes
July 22, 2020
Teleconference / MS Teams Meeting / In-person
Abrams Building, Room 2388
3950 S. Country Club Road
Tucson, Arizona 85714

1. CALL TO ORDER

Dr. Horwitz called meeting to order at 3:00PM

ATTENDANCE:

Mr. Bin An - Absent
Ms. Betty Villegas
Mr. Rene Gastelum - Absent
Mr. Charles Geoffrion, Vice President
Ms. Mary Lou Gonzales
Dr. Paul Horwitz, President
Mr. Mike Humphrey (Arrived after roll call)
Dr. Kathryn Kohler
Mr. Miguel Rojas
Dr. Gail Smith
Ms. Carolyn Trowbridge

A quorum was established (8)

Non-Board Members

Dr. Francisco García, Deputy County Administrator, Pima County
Dr. Theresa Cullen, Pima County Public Health Director
Paula Mandel, Pima County Health Department, Deputy Director
Dr. Kristin Barney, Pima County Health Department, CFO Division Manager

2. PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE

Due to Teleconference Meeting the Pledge of Allegiance was not conducted.

3. MINUTES ADOPTION

- Adopted Board of Health Minutes June 24, 2020

The motion was made and seconded (Mr. Rojas/Ms. Gonzales) that the June 24, 2020, Board of Health Minutes be adopted no further discussion. Motion carried 8 – 0.

- Adopted Board of Health Emergency Meeting Minutes July 6, 2020

The motion was made and seconded (Mr. Rojas/Dr. Kohler) that the July 6, 2020, Board of Health Emergency Meeting Minutes be adopted no further discussion. Motion carried 8 – 0.

4. DIRECTOR'S UPDATE

- Dr. Cullen provided a COVID-19 update:
 - Pima County Kino Event Center was set up as a PCR (nasopharyngeal) testing facility roughly 10 days ago.
 - Appointments are scheduled online or by phone, and the site is seeing between 500-600 people per day.
 - Positivity rates range from 7%-15%
 - There is a high percentage of asymptomatic people testing positive, up to 20-30%
 - Pima County will be standing up another testing site through ASU
 - Committed to getting test result back within 24-48 hours. There are some issues and are working to accelerate test results.
- Dr. Cullen provided an update on case investigations:
 - Internally have 14 people working on case investigations, which is insufficient due to the number of cases.
 - Have asked the contractor, Maximus, to bring on case investigators; 6 who are being trained July 20-23 and will start work on July 24. An additional 17 case investigators have been requested.
 - Each case is estimated to take 45-60 minutes, and the objective is to get a contact list.
 - PCHD is hiring 120-140 contact tracers; 40 will start working the week of July 27, and the remaining will begin training the week of July 27. These additional contact tracers will also look at negative results to see if they can determine why people are testing as the belief is that some are contacts of other positive COVID positive individuals.
- Dr. Horwitz noted that the Kino testing process is impressive, but the results are time-delayed. He stated that contact tracing is severely jeopardized if there are significant delays in obtaining test results. Both Dr. Cullen and Dr. Garcia agreed that the delays do jeopardize the ability to effectively contact trace. Dr. Horwitz raised the question whether Pima County could incentivize or de-incentivize its contract(s) with various outside entities to stipulate more timely results. Dr. Cullen stated this was under consideration. He asked if the public should ask the testing site when the results will be given. Dr. Cullen advised that PCHD is providing communication materials with details and expectations to every lab in the county and are asking them to print and distribute it to every individual who gets tested. PCHD is also asking the state testing website to include more information that PCHD collects to have a more extensive list of test site information online.
- COVID numbers in Arizona have been about 2,000 cases per week – the last report was about 2,300, but not all labs were counted.
- Some Epidemiology curves continue to go down.
- Hospitals are reporting they believe they are in a lull as more ICU beds are available.
- The surge line continues to move people around the state; there have been more than 1,900 transfers in the state with the vast majority coming from rural Arizona.

- We may be seeing the impact of recent societal changes made.
- Pima County has adequate PPE but there is a shortage of small and medium gloves
- The State has urged counties who have overloaded warehouse to share with other counties that need supplies
- Have received 30 ventilators and more are on the way.
- Hospital capacity is high but not getting worse; we are still in the red, which is not good.
- The Pima County EOC has now been active since March, and PCHD is currently evaluating how to move from an acute response phase to a chronic disaster response phase.
- PCHD is working with schools to provide guidance on best practices and decision-making for reopening, as well as plans on how to support schools with PPE needs.
- Immunizations for back to school and flu season are a priority for PCHD, as well as getting ready for a COVID vaccine when it is available.
- The Consumer Health and Food Safety (CHFS) B2B initiative is working closely with Administrator Huckleberry and the business community in evaluating and providing oversight with the current bar closures.
- Dr. Smith asked what the Pima County mortality rate is. Dr. Cullen noted that it is higher than other Arizona counties and a study is being done to evaluate that. Dr. Garcia mentioned that the population age distribution in Pima County skews to the older age groups, while Maricopa County is skewed to younger age groups. The fatality rate in Pima County is 37.5% / 100K population, where Maricopa County is 36.61% / 100K population, and has gotten worse now. Additionally, the mortality rate among white, non-Hispanic populations is significantly higher in Pima County than it has been in other counties.

5. UPDATE REGARDING THE BOH'S FIVE PASSED MOTIONS (07/06/2020) AND CURRENT AND POSSIBLE FUTURE PIMA COUNTY RESPONSE/SACTIONS

- Dr. Horwitz noted that these motions were not acted upon due to the other Pima County Board of Supervisors (BOS) members not having the information to review prior to their meeting on July 7, 2020 and was not formally posted on the Agenda so no action could be taken on these specific items.
- Supervisor Villegas reported that BOS Administrator Huckleberry indicated that the five motions are being reviewed, and that the BOS will determine how to move forward with the ones they feel are feasible and accomplishable. The goal is to have something on the August 17, 2020 BOS meeting agenda.
- Supervisor Villegas commented that the highest rate of Tucson COVID-19 cases seem to still be located on the south side. Different messaging to constituents is needed, the messaging needs to be right, and all mediums of communication need to be used to get people to listen. Supervisor Villegas and BOS Chair Ramón Valadez

will be meeting with community leaders to establish a task force, or commission, to advise what is missing in current messaging, and what can be done better.

- Supervisor Villegas noted that out of the five motions passed, the one that will be most difficult will be Motion 3, the recommendation to close bars in restaurants, as there is already a considerable amount of criticism and possible litigation directed at Pima County for doing more than the Governor's Executive Order does. The BOS is still looking at possibilities to move the motion forward.
- Dr. Horwitz recommended reaching out to Too Soon Arizona, a coalition of very established and respected community small business owners for assistance with this issue. Supervisor Villegas appreciates that recommendation, and will follow-up on that.
- Mr. Geoffrion thanked Supervisor Villegas for keeping the BOH concerns alive at the BOS meetings.
- Supervisor Villegas advised she will keep the BOH apprised of what motions may move forward.

6. FORMATION OF A PIMA COUNTY HEALTH DEPARTMENT ETHICS COMMITTEE

- Dr. Barney discussed the Ethics Committee documentation provided for the BOH members review:
 - Code of Ethics are the principles of ethical practice of Public Health and the guidelines for ethical decision-making.
 - Policy of the Ethics Committee is the operating policy and procedures including purpose, outline of membership, and the term length and review process.
 - Process Map provides detail on the review process.
- Dr. Horwitz advised that two BOH members are interested in serving on the Ethics Committee: Ms. Trowbridge and Mr. Geoffrion. Ms. Gonzales also indicated her interest but expressed concern regarding the number of members allowed to represent the BOH on the committee. Ultimately, Dr. Horwitz stated that this decision will be made by Dr. Cullen after she has the opportunity to review all documents and consult with her senior leadership at the Department.
- Ms. Mandel provided insight about best practices in setting up the Ethics Committee, focusing on the number of BOH representatives, and recommended that the BOH representative would rotate out on a yearly basis, allowing all interested members to cycle in the Ethics Committee rather than having multiple members at one time.
- Ms. Trowbridge inquired if the Ethics Committee would be just another barrier between the PCHD, the BOH, and the BOS.
- Ms. Mandel noted that the Ethics Committee is a community advisory group that presents the opportunity to gain more support and advocacy within the community, a place for community partners to voice concerns, have a discussion, and then present those concerns to the BOH. The BOH will determine the recommendation to be made to the BOS. Ms. Mandel also noted that having an Ethics Committee is an important component regarding the reaccreditation process for the PCHD.

- Supervisor Villegas agreed that the Ethics Committee is an advisory group for the BOH and not a decision-making body.
- Dr. Barney confirmed that the Ethics Committee would do an initial assessment of an issue to determine who that issue will be presented to. Depending what the issue is, recommendations from the committee would then be forwarded to the BOH and/or to Pima County administration for review.
- Dr. Cullen believes that PCHD will seek reaccreditation and will move forward with the conceptual model of an Ethics Committee as it is considered a standard for accreditation. Ms. Mandel suggested that Alan Bergen speak to the BOH about the Ethics Committee as regards reaccreditation.
- Dr. Cullen also requested that the PCHD be permitted to review the original plan for positions and then report back to the BOH. Dr. Horwitz agreed with Dr. Cullen's request that she review everything internally with senior leadership and report back to the BOH

**7. AN ANALYSIS OF COVID-19'S IMPACT ON PIMA COUNTY DISTRICT 5
"THE PANDEMIC SHINES A LIGHT ON SOCIAL INEQUITIES"
CONTINUING DISCUSSION/UPDATE**

- Supervisor Villegas reported that BOS will continue to look at what can be done now in the short-term to address the racial and inequality issues:
- BOS Chair Ramón Valadez and Supervisor Villegas are co-chairing a task force that may end up becoming part of a Latino outreach task force.
- Knows there are barriers to mobile testing so have added the possibility of pop-up testing to the report, for example using local churches in the area to make pop-up test events available to the public. The idea is to bring people out once for the opportunity to get a mobile vaccination at the same time as a COVID-19 test.
- Has recommended formation of a Racial Health Equity task force as a long-term program to address the inequities in Pima County, and is hoping that the Ethics Committee could look at that as well.
- Supervisor Villegas noted that a major issue in declaring racism a public health crisis is making sure to look at ways to mitigate the crisis by having an action item and addressing systemic issues and how to fix them.
- Mr. Humphrey asked if the Healthy Pima initiative can be dovetailed with Supervisor Villegas's plan to address these issues in all five supervisory districts.
- Supervisor Villegas would love to hear additional thoughts at the next BOH meeting.

8. NOMINATING COMMITTEE OF BOARD OF HEALTH OFFICERS REPORT

- Dr. Smith reported that the Nominating Committee had a conference call with Mr. Geoffrion and Ms. Gonzales to review any and all individuals who offered interest in being on the BOH slate. The Nominating Committee recommended the following slate: Dr. Paul Horwitz, as President, and Mr. Geoffrion, as Vice President.

9. ELECTION BOARD OF HEALTH OFFICERS

- Mr. Rojas recommended a vote by acclamation as there is only one candidate running for each position on the BOH slate.
- Dr. Horwitz advised the members that the coordinator, Suzanne Goodman, was advised by the Clerk of the Board of Supervisors that due to the pandemic, Board members may vote by absentee ballot. Dr. Smith inquired why a vote was necessary if the slate only has one person for each position, and Mr. Rojas stated that the vote by acclamation is the same as an absentee ballot.
- Mr. Rojas moved, and Supervisor Villegas seconded, to accept the recommendation of a vote by acclamation. The motion carried unanimously.
- Dr. Horwitz asked the members to document the vote of acclamation by sending an email to the coordinator.

10. SUMMATION OF ACTION ITEMS & PROPOSAL OF FUTURE AGENDA ITEMS

- Discussion of the Ethics Committee draft will be added to the next BOH meeting agenda, and Ms. Mandel agreed to make the draft available for review by BOH members prior to the next meeting.
- An ongoing conversation with possible action recommendations regarding Supervisor Villegas' white paper "The Pandemic Shines a Light on Social Inequities."
- Dr. Horwitz reminded the Board to send him any future items for the agenda by email.

11. ADJOURNMENT

The motion was made and seconded (Mr. Rojas/Ms. Gonzales) that the July 22, 2020 meeting adjourn. Motion carried 10-0.

The meeting adjourned at 4:50PM

The next meeting is scheduled for August 26, 2020, at 3:00 P.M.