



MEMORANDUM

Date: October 13, 2015

To: The Honorable Chair and Members
Pima County Board of Supervisors

From: C.H. Huckelberry
County Administrator

Re: **Take-home Vehicle Use – Comprehensive Report**

Supervisor Ally Miller placed an item on the October 6, 2015 Board of Supervisors Addendum regarding take-home vehicles of County Supervisors. The item raised a number of questions, and the Board requested a comprehensive report on County vehicle use.

While the agenda item was designed for political theater, County vehicle use is an appropriate policy discussion for the Board. This memorandum will provide the Board with the information necessary to craft appropriate and sound public policy regarding County vehicle use.

Potential Savings if County Supervisors Did Not Have Take-Home Vehicles

The basic question raised by Supervisor Miller was whether there would be public cost savings if Supervisors did not have take-home vehicles. The answer to this question requires analysis of Supervisors' actual use of County provided vehicles. Table 1 below shows data from the most recent reporting period available to the County from November 1, 2013 through October 31, 2014.

This data was compiled from several sources associated with Fleet Services and the Finance Department for income tax benefit reporting purposes when a County vehicle is provided to an employee or elected official for use in conducting official business.

**Table 1: Board of Supervisors Use of County Vehicles, Most Recent Reporting Period:
November 1, 2013 through October 31, 2014.**

Supervisor	Total Miles Driven ¹	Personal Miles Reported By Supervisor	Approximate Distance from County Office to Residence ²	Total Fuel Costs ¹	Fuel Cost per mile	Approximate Savings If No Personal Use ³
Ally Miller	5,647	100	15.4	\$ 489.85	\$0.087	\$ 8.67
Ramón Valadez	16,326	2,956	19.6	1,032.88	0.063	187.01
Sharon Bronson	9,113	3,492	9.9	1,234.72	0.069	473.14
Ray Carroll	15,892	2,400	8.9	1,418.38	0.089	214.20
Richard Elías	7,823	3,500	3.4	901.84	0.076	403.48

¹ Amounts reported in County Fleet Services and in County Financial Systems for the stated period. The County tracks vehicle usage from November through the end of October each year.

² Distances shown are based on home addresses reported in Supervisors' annual financial disclosures on file with the Clerk of the Board.

³ Estimated savings to the County if Supervisors used their own vehicles to commute to and from work. The County would still own and maintain the vehicles for Supervisor use for County-related work activities.

The first question is would the County not need these County vehicles if the Supervisors chose not to take their vehicles home? The simple answer is no, as the Supervisors would still require transportation for business purposes. The vehicle would essentially remain parked at the County building when not in use. If Supervisors used their personal vehicles for business use, they would be entitled to be reimbursed mileage based on County policy, which reimburses employees conducting County business at the rate of \$0.445 per mile. The County has not raised its reimbursement rate since 2006. The current Internal Revenue Service (IRS) rate is \$0.575 per mile.

To determine the probable savings from eliminating County take-home vehicles for Supervisors, analysis is required of the personal versus public use of the vehicles assigned to Supervisors. Personal miles are those miles traveled by a Supervisor from the Supervisor's residence to their work location and from their work location to their residence. Table 1 provides this analysis. The personal miles reported by the Supervisor are the same miles used to calculate the taxable benefit that is reported to the IRS. The amount of personal miles for the 12-months ending October 31, 2014 varies widely by Supervisor with the least reported by Supervisor Miller at 100 miles per year and the most reported by Supervisor Richard Elfás at 3,500 miles per year. This is an extreme variance

The cost savings analysis then is simply the fuel cost savings if the vehicles were not used for personal use. The last column of Table 1 shows this fuel cost savings, which is less than \$500 per Supervisor if Supervisors did not use their vehicles to commute to and from home to their place of employment at 130 W. Congress. Obviously, the savings are not significant. If there were no County vehicles provided to Supervisors, the simple cost savings on a monthly basis could easily be consumed in just a few trips; for example, by the District 3 Supervisor traveling to Ajo, Arizona. This 270-mile round trip would require a mileage reimbursement of \$120.15 based on the current County mileage rate of \$0.445. It is clear there are very little to no cost savings if the Supervisors were not provided take-home vehicles.

Are There Savings That Could be Achieved if all Take-Home Vehicles Were Eliminated?

The simple answer is yes, but the cost and benefit of providing a take-home vehicle is much more complicated than can be seen from a simple economic analysis. The best

example would be to examine the savings that could be achieved by the County if all of the nearly 500 Pima County Sheriff's Deputies and Detectives were eliminated and if Sheriff employees were required to begin their work shift at a central or other designated location. This would mean they would drive their personal vehicle to that location and then begin using a County vehicle. This method is presently used by the Tucson Police Department. Conservatively, if all of these vehicles were not on a take-home status, the annualized cost savings to the County would be \$290,000; and County vehicles would be driven 2,958,000 few miles, thus reducing the County's exposure to liability for accidents during daily commutes.

However, we have provided the Board in the past numerous take-home vehicle studies conducted by the Sheriff's Department that conclude the additional cost to take a patrol vehicle home and park it at the deputy's residence is offset by other factors such as the ability to immediately respond to on-call or emergency situations, as well as the crime deterrent effects of having a marked patrol vehicle in a neighborhood.

While it appears such a policy would save money, it actually would be shortsighted and not a policy recommended by myself or the Sheriff.

Take-home Vehicle Analysis by Fleet Services

Attached is the most recent take-home vehicle report by Fleet Services. This report is prepared on an annual basis and management evaluates the benefits and costs associated with all County take-home vehicles, excluding undercover vehicles that are differentiated from unmarked vehicles. The County fleet contains 1,663 vehicles. Focusing only on 5 take-home Supervisor vehicles further underscores the political theater statement earlier in this memorandum.

Again, there are 1,663 vehicles in the County fleet. The total number of County take-home vehicles is 645, and their departmental distribution is shown in Table 2 below.

Table 2: County Take-home Vehicles by Department.

Department	Number of Take-home Vehicles
Sheriff	493
County Attorney	23
Indigent Defense	13
All Other Departments	116
Total	645

Of the remaining 116 take-home vehicles, the department with the largest number of take-home vehicles is Regional Wastewater Reclamation Department (RWRD) with 32. Vehicles

The Honorable Chair and Members, Pima County Board of Supervisors
Re: Take-home Vehicle Use – Comprehensive Report
October 13, 2015
Page 4

assigned to Board members represent approximately one quarter of one percent of the County vehicle fleet and approximately six tenths of one percent of County take-home vehicles. Of these 32 vehicles, almost all are utility-type vehicles, and only 16 go home on any given day due to the 24/7 operations of the RWRD.

I would recommend no modifications to vehicle take-home policies, nor would I recommend any modifications to the take-home policy for County elected officials, including members of the Board of Supervisors. I do recommend the County notify, in writing, all individuals who report personal mileage to ensure they understand personal mileage must be accurately reported and that failure to do so could result in IRS fines and penalties for underreporting County-provided benefits.

CHH/anc

Attachment

c: John Bernal, Deputy County Administrator for Public Works
Tom Burke, Deputy County Administrator for Administration
Jan Leshner, Deputy County Administrator for Medical and Health Services

Summary of Vehicles Listed Below

Department	Count
Assessor	1
BOS District 2	1
BOS District 3	1
BOS District 4	1
BOS District 5	1
Clerk of the Court	1
Constables	9
County Administration	1
Dept. of Transportation	15
Department of Environmental Quality	1
Development Services	9
Economic Development & Tourism	1
Elections	1
Facilities Management	24
Fleet Services	2
Information Technology	5
Office of Emergency Management	1
PCWIN	1
Public Works Administration	2
Recorder	1
Regional Flood Control District	3
RWRD	32
Schools	1
Treasurer	1
Total Take Home Vehicles	116

Vehicles Not Listed Above Assigned To:

Department	Count
County Attorney Total	23
Public Defense Total	13
PCSD Total	493
Total Take Home Vehicles	529

Total Take Home Vehicles Countywide 645

FY15/16 Take Home Vehicle Report

Department	Last Name	First Name	Job Classification	Year	Make	Model	Property Number
Assessor	Staples	Bill	Assessor	2012	Jeep	Wrangler	118549
BOS District 2	Valadez	Ramon	Board of Supervisor	2014	Ford	Fusion	124696
BOS District 3	Bronson	Sharon	Board of Supervisor, Chairperson	2014	Ford	Escape	124730
BOS District 4	Carroll	Raymond	Board of Supervisor	2012	Chevrolet	Volt	118556
BOS District 5	Elias	Richard	Board of Supervisor	2015	Ford	Escape	126683
Clerk of the Court	Hellon	Toni	Clerk of the Superior Court	2015	Toyota	Prius	124664
Constables	Fontes	Frank	Constable, JP2	2014	Ford	Escape	124677
Constables	Driscoll	Jim	Constable, JP4	2012	Ford	F250 Pick Up	118575
Constables	Cummings	Marge	Constable, JP5	2007	Ford	Escape	113380
Constables	Bernal	Bennett	Constable, JP6	2007	Ford	Crown Victoria	113387
Constables	Brown	RC	Constable, JP7	2014	Ford	Silverado 1500	124645
Constables	Dorgan	Mary	Constable, JP8	2011	Ford	Fusion	117726
Constables	Philip	Colette	Constable, JP9	2006	Ford	Escape	110337
Constables	Roberts	Vince	Constable, JP10	2012	Ford	F250 Pick Up	118574
Constables	Rademaker	John	Constable	2004	Ford	F150 Pickup	105768
County Administration	Huckelberry	Chuck	County Administrator	2013	Ford	Explorer	123235
Dept. of Transportation	Andrade	Roy	PW Supervisor	2011	Chevrolet	Silverado	117795
Dept. of Transportation	Armenta	Tito	PW Crew Supervisor	2012	Chevrolet	Silverado	112585
Dept. of Transportation	Clark	Victor	PW Crew Supervisor	2014	Ford	F150	124687
Dept. of Transportation	DaWalt	Eric	PW Supervisor	2006	Chevrolet	Silverado 2500	110413
Dept. of Transportation	Felix	John	PW Crew Supervisor	2011	Chevrolet	Silverado	117794
Dept. of Transportation	Marti	Joe	PW Crew Supervisor	2012	Chevrolet	Silverado	118586
Dept. of Transportation	Martinez	Matt	PW Supervisor	2014	Ford	F250 3/4 Ton Pick Up	124668
Dept. of Transportation	Soto	Joseph	PW Manager	2014	Ford	Explorer	124673
Dept. of Transportation	Tapia	Rafael	PW Crew Supervisor	2007	Ford	F250 Super Duty	124671
Dept. of Transportation	Tapley	Lou	PW Manager	2014	Ford	Explorer	124674
Dept. of Transportation	Yrigolla	Conrad	PW Supervisor	2013	Chevrolet	Silverado	122277
Dept. of Transportation	Gigliotti	Richard	PW Crew Supervisor	2012	Chevrolet	Silverado	118583
Dept. of Transportation	Carrillo	Gilbert	Public Works Supervisor	2012	Chevrolet	Silverado 2500	118584
Dept. of Transportation	Bojorquez	Jesus	Civil Engineering Assistant	2012	Ford	Fusion	118548
Dept. of Transportation	Padilla	Eduardo	Traffic Pavement Marking Supv	2014	Chevrolet	Silverado 2500	124659
Department of Environmental Quality	Kramer	Ursula	Director	2012	Chevrolet	Volt	118557
Development Services	Reeves	Stacey	Inspector I	2014	Toyota	Tacoma	124660
Development Services	Chandler	Robert	Chief Building Inspector	2013	Toyota	Prius	122111
Development Services	Knape	Linda	Inspection Supervisor	2006	Ford	Explorer	110455
Development Services	Majewski	Bill	Inspector II	2014	Toyota	Prius	124661
Development Services	Farkas	Robert	Code Inspector	2008	Ford	Escape	115147

FY15/16 Take Home Vehicle Report

Department	Last Name	First Name	Job Classification	Year	Make	Model	Property Number
Development Services	Swegle	Sam	Inspector I	2007	Toyota	Prius	113355
Development Services	Riggs	Dan	Inspector I	2007	Toyota	Prius	113356
Development Services	Pierce	Dan	Inspector 1	2013	Toyota	Prius	122109
Development Services	Moore	Marck (Kevin)	Inspector 1	2008	Ford	Escape	116443
Economic Development & Tourism	Moulton	Tom	Director	2006	Ford	Escape Hybrid	110482
Elections	Nelson	Brad	Director	2012	Hyundai	Sonata	122097
Facilities Management	Kunzmann	Brian	Trades Maintenance Specialist	2005	Dodge	3/4 Ton Pick Up	106700
Facilities Management	Gatlin	Tracy	Trades Maintenance Specialist	2013	Chevrolet	3/4 Ton Pick Up	122162
Facilities Management	Weise	Brian	Trades Maintenance Specialist	2012	Chevrolet	3/4 Ton Pick Up	119438
Facilities Management	Grabowski	Joe	Trades Maintenance Specialist	2005	Chevrolet	1/2 Ton Pick Up	107925
Facilities Management	Walker	Michael	Trades Maintenance Specialist	2002	Ford	1/2 Ton Pick Up	100874
Facilities Management	Moreno	Alvaro	Trades Maintenance Specialist	2001	Dodge	1/2 Ton Pick Up	098741
Facilities Management	Gonzales	Sergio	Trades Maintenance Specialist	2013	Chevrolet	3/4 Ton Pick Up	122163
Facilities Management	Estrella	Luis	Trades Maintenance Specialist	2006	Dodge	3/4 Ton Pick Up 4x4	110428
Facilities Management	Cutino	Gumer	Trades Maintenance Specialist	2014	Ford	F250	124695
Facilities Management	Brydon	Hugh	Trades Maintenance Specialist	2013	Chevrolet	3/4 Ton Pick Up	122166
Facilities Management	Martinson	Paul	Trades Maintenance Specialist	2005	Chevrolet	1/2 Ton Pick Up	107927
Facilities Management	Angle	Dave	Trades Maintenance Specialist	2005	Dodge	3/4 Ton Pick Up	107957
Facilities Management	Calderon	Jose	Trades Maintenance Specialist	2005	Dodge	3/4 Ton Pick Up	107959
Facilities Management	Carrillo	Rudy	Trades Maintenance Specialist	2012	Chevrolet	4x4	118579
Facilities Management	Hall	Wade	Trades Maintenance Specialist	2015	Chevrolet	Silverado 3500	126694
Facilities Management	Vielma	Rey	Trades Maintenance Specialist	2002	GMC	3/4 Ton Pick Up	101039
Facilities Management	Cota	Raul	Trades Maintenance Specialist	2012	Chevrolet	Silverado 2500	118602
Facilities Management	Orantez	Fernando	Trades Maintenance Specialist	2015	Chevrolet	Silverado 1 Ton 4x4	124725
Facilities Management	Corral	Frank	Trades Maintenance Specialist	2015	Chevrolet	3500 4x4	124726
Facilities Management	Garcia	David	Trades Maintenance Specialist	2011	Ford	3/4 Ton Pick Up	117738
Facilities Management	Alvarez	Robert	Trades Maintenance Specialist	2007	Ford	F150	113274
Facilities Management	Snow	Patrick	Trades Maintenance Specialist	2015	Ford	1/2 Ton Pick Up	126697
Facilities Management	Castella	Peter	Trades Maintenance Specialist	2002	Ford	1/2 Ton Pick Up	101349
Facilities Management	Teran	Jimmy	Trades Maintenance Specialist	2015	Chevrolet	Silverado 3500	126695
Fleet Services	Samaniego	Frank	Director	2014	Ford	Fusion	124721
Fleet Services	Ochotorena	Ray	Deputy Director	2011	Hyundai	Sonata	117276
Information Technology	Varies			2012	Jeep	Wrangler	118025
Information Technology	Varies			2012	Jeep	Wrangler	118024
Information Technology	Varies			2012	Jeep	Wrangler	118026
Information Technology	Varies			2006	Chevrolet	3/4 Ton Pick Up	110406
Information Technology	Varies			2013	Toyota	Tacoma	119440

FY15/16 Take Home Vehicle Report

Department	Last Name	First Name	Job Classification	Year	Make	Model	Property Number
Office of Emergency Management	Guthrie	Jeff	Director	2011	Ford	Expedition	117785
PCWIN	Voorhees	John	PCWIN Executive Director	2014	Ford	Escape	124729
Public Works Administration	Bernal	John	Deputy County Administrator-PW	2012	Hyundai	Sonata	122099
Public Works Administration	Slusser	Nanette	Asst County Administrator for Public Work Policies	2007	Toyota	Highlander	113390
Recorder	Rodriguez	F. Ann	Pima County Recorder	2011	Chevrolet	Traverse	117749
Regional Flood Control District	Wassmuth	Paul	Public Works Manager	2013	Ford	F150 Pick up	124136
Regional Flood Control District	Burklow	Steve	Public Works Supervisor - Senior	2006	Chevrolet	Silverado	110424
Regional Flood Control District	LaValley	Paul	Public Works Supervisor	2009	Ford	Ranger	116599
RWRD	Mulvey	Peter	Civil Engineering Manager	2007	Ford	Expedition	113337
RWRD	Jenkins	Jackson	Director	2012	Chevrolet	Tahoe	118577
RWRD	Olson	Keith	Trades Maintenance Foreman	2009	Chevrolet	Silverado 2500	116775
RWRD	Amendola	Joseph	Utility Maint Worker III	2006	Ford	F350 Super Duty	110460
RWRD	Cohen	Aaron	Utility Maint Worker III	2008	Ford	F250 Super Duty	113339
RWRD	Padilla	Alex	Utility Maint Worker III	2012	Chevrolet	Silverado 3500	118609
RWRD	Yanez	Miguel	Trades Maint Spec Electrician	2013	Chevrolet	Silverado 3500	122150
RWRD	Bellinger	Ira	PW Crew Supervisor	2011	Chevrolet	Silverado 1500	117746
RWRD	Robles	Eddie	PW Crew Supervisor	2013	Chevrolet	Silverado	122179
RWRD	Crawford	Mike	PW Crew Supervisor	2011	Chevrolet	Silverado 1500	117745
RWRD	Soto-Ortega	Julio	PW Crew Supervisor	2005	GMC	Sierra 2500	106711
RWRD	Benzenhoefer	Michael	Utility Locator	2015	Chevrolet	Silverado 1500	126667
RWRD	Gupton	Adam	Utility Locator	2013	Chevrolet	Silverado	122190
RWRD	Rogers	Tom	Utility Locator	2013	Chevrolet	Silverado	122148
RWRD	Smith	Gary	Utility Locator	2012	Chevrolet	Silverado 1500	117748
RWRD	Sherlock	John	Deputy Director	2009	Ford	Escape	116780
RWRD	Norzagaray	Arturo	WWTP Manager	2008	Ford	Escape	116539
RWRD	Weber	Ken	WWTP Manager	2012	Chevrolet	Silverado 4x4	118580
RWRD	Van Riper	Jack	WWTP Manager	2012	Ford	Escape	118000
RWRD	Parkinson	Matthew	PW Crew Supervisor	2008	Ford	F250 Super Duty	113333
RWRD	Roberts	Craig	PW Construction Inspector	2014	Ford	F150	124680
RWRD	Morrison	Paul	Trades Maint Spec Electrician	2004	Ford	F250 Super Duty	105495
RWRD	Nanez	Benny	Utility Locator	2009	Ford	Ranger	116777
RWRD	Olson	Eric	PW Supervisor	2011	Chevrolet	Silverado 1500	118002
RWRD	Sentz	Joel	Utility Locator	2012	Chevrolet	Silverado 2500	118605
RWRD	Arevalo	Eddie	Utility Maint Worker I	2013	Chevrolet	Silverado 1500	122178
RWRD	Bailey	Neil	Utility Locator	2014	Ford	F150	124691
RWRD	Vecchia	Jonathan	Utility Locator	2009	Ford	Ranger	116597

FY15/16 Take Home Vehicle Report

Department	Last Name	First Name	Job Classification	Year	Make	Model	Property Number
RWRD	Lizarraga	Eric	PW Construction Inspector	2004	Dodge	Ram 1500	105719
RWRD	Jacobs	Tim	PW Inspector	2002	Ford	F150	100989
RWRD	Montoya	Mike	PW Construction Inspector	2014	Ford	F150	124683
RWRD	Brown	Steve	PW Construction Inspector Sr.	2014	Ford	F150	124682
Schools	Arzoumanian	Linda	Director	2012	Chevrolet	Equinox	118030
Treasurer	Ford	Beth	Treasurer	2015	Ford	Fusion	126675